



(European Cooperation and Learning to Implement Transport Solutions to combat Exclusion)



EUROPEAN COMMISSION – DG EMPLOYMENT, SOCIAL AFFAIRS AND EQUAL OPPORTUNITIES



ECLIPSE (European Cooperation and Learning to Implement Transport Solutions to combat Exclusion)

ECLIPSE National Workshop

The role of transport in tackling social exclusion



Minutes
Paris, France – 11th May 2007



This project has received funding from the European Commission within the Community Action Programme to Combat Social Exclusion 2002-2006

The information contained herein is the sole responsibility of the author, and the Commission declines all responsibility for the use that may be made of it

TABLE OF CONTENTS

1. Synthèse Rapide (Summary in French)	1
2. Purpose and Workshop Agenda	2
3. Delegates / audience	4
4. The Workshop	4
5. Conclusions	12
Annexes	
A – List of participants	
B – Presentations	

1. Synthèse Rapide

Séminaire national ECLIPSE – ‘*Le transport : un remède contre l'exclusion sociale?*’, accueilli par le Groupement des Autorités Responsables de Transport (GART).

Dans le cadre du projet européen ECLIPSE (*Coopération Européenne pour la promotion du Transport dans la lutte contre l'Exclusion Sociale*, www.eclipse-eu.net) - dont Transport & Travel Research (TTR, www.ttr-ltd.com) est le coordinateur - un séminaire ayant pour thème « *Le transport : un remède contre l'exclusion sociale ?* » s'est tenu le 11 mai 2007 au Groupement des Autorités Responsables de Transport (GART, www.gart.org), à Paris.

Le projet ECLIPSE a pour objectif principal de s'interroger sur les mécanismes qui existent entre « transports de personnes » et « intégration sociale », de travailler sur les bonnes pratiques et de pratiquer une veille sur les politiques européennes et nationales en la matière.

Des représentants des collectivités territoriales, associations d'élus, Etat et Gouvernement notamment sont intervenus lors de cette rencontre.

Ce séminaire a été l'occasion de présenter l'état des politiques mises en œuvre en France, et d'analyser des exemples nationaux de bonnes pratiques. Par ailleurs, une visite de terrain organisée par l'Association des Maires Ville est Banlieue (www.ville-et-banlieue.org) s'est tenue l'après-midi, qui a permis d'alimenter débats et réflexions. Cette rencontre a accueilli une quarantaine de participants.

Après un mot d'accueil du GART posant les problématiques de la journée, TTR et POLIS ont présenté le projet ECLIPSE et les différentes initiatives européennes qui tentent d'articuler les politiques liées au transport et celles en faveur de l'intégration sociale.

L'intervention de la Direction Générale de l'Action Sociale (DGAS, www.cohesionsociale.gouv.fr) a permis quant à elle de dresser un panorama des politiques sociales qui intègrent la dimension transport, leur manque et les perspectives. Le Conseil National des Transports (CNT, <http://cnt.bysoft.fr/>) est ensuite revenu sur l'importance d'une bonne coordination / articulation entre planification urbaine et organisation des transports.

Suite à ces présentations, le Syndicat Mixte des Transports de l'agglomération Clermontoise (SMTC, www.letram-clermontferrand.com/smtc) a présenté comment l'articulation transport / social était pratiquée à Clermont-Ferrand.

L'ensemble des interventions a été suivi de discussions en présence de la Déléguée Interministérielle à l'Accessibilité.

L'après-midi fut l'occasion pour l'ensemble des participants de se rendre à Sarcelles (banlieue nord de Paris) pour une visite du Pôle Gare de Garches-Sarcelles, suivie de discussions avec des élus de Sarcelles et des responsables locaux.

Les présentations, discussions ainsi que les conclusions de la journée sont rédigées en anglais dans les sections suivantes.

2. Purpose and Workshop Agenda

The ECLIPSE (European Cooperation and Learning to Implement Transport Solutions to combat Exclusion) project is one of 24 projects funded under the European Commission 2nd Trans-national Exchange Programme (TEP).

There is a need at European, national and local level for transport and social agencies to engage in joint strategy planning to ensure that transport policy is an agent for inclusion. While Member States and the European Commission recognise the need for greater joint working, few Member States are addressing the issue. There is also a need to make transport professionals aware of the impacts of policy on exclusion, and to demonstrate the good practice that exists in using transport strategies to enhance inclusion.

Within the context of the ECLIPSE project, Transport & Travel Research Ltd (TTR) organised a National Workshop in Paris to examine the role of transport in tackling social exclusion, focusing on the situation in France. The workshop looked at national, regional and local initiatives and topics such as the affordability of transport, transport measures in the National Action Plan for Social Inclusion and the accessibility of public transport. The workshop aimed to provide a platform for discussion between various actors - Ministries, local authorities, transport actors and other associations.

In the afternoon, delegates went on a site visit organised by the “Association des Maires Ville et Banlieue” (www.ville-et-banlieue.org) in Sarcelles (in the northern suburbs of Paris) where they were able to see where the future tram will run and understand the effect that this transport policy may have on social inclusion. Afterwards, there was a discussion between the local politicians and town officers on how, locally, transport and land use policies can be interlinked with employment policies.



Final Agenda

“The role of transport in tackling Social Inclusion”

11th May 2007, Paris, France

9.30 **Registration**

Morning Session - 1st Chair: Sylvain Haon, POLIS

10.00 **Welcome**
Claire Dagnogo, GART

10.10 **Introduction to ECLIPSE**
Arnaud Lagrange, TTR Ltd

10.25 **Transport and social inclusion: European initiatives**
Ivo Cre, POLIS

10.40 **Transport, social and professional inclusion**
Catherine Lesterpt, Directorate-General for Public Affairs

11.35 **Coffee break**

2nd Chair: Mary Crass, OECD

11.20 **Using Public space as a tool for social inclusion**
Catherine Chartrain, National Council for Transport

11.40 **The role of the Local Authorities in the fight against social exclusion**
Patrick Ferri and Regis Savarit, Clermont-Ferrand Public Transport Authority

12.05 **What are the challenges and solutions?**
Debate chaired by Mary Crass, OECD

12.45 **Lunch**

13.45 **Site Visit**
Organised by “Association des Maires Ville et Banlieue”, in Sarcelles to see how transport and social policies can be linked.

16.15 **End of the Workshop**

3. Delegates / audience

As this event was a national workshop, it aimed to provide the opportunity for discussion not only for local actors involved in developing strategies but also for representatives of government, public transport authorities and operators from across France.

The workshop was organised by TTR, in cooperation with GART (French Association of Transport Authorities) and the “Association des Maires de Ville & Banlieue”.

40 people attended the workshop, of whom 21 were female and 19 were male (see Annex A for the list of participants).

The workshop was presented in the French language.



4. The Workshop

Morning Session - Part 1

Mr. Sylvain Haon (POLIS) chaired the first part of the workshop.

- **Welcome to the workshop, Claire Dagnogo, Groupement des Autorités Responsables de Transport (GART)**

Ms. Dagnogo welcomed the delegates on behalf of the GART team. She began by explaining that although transport should be considered a tool in combating social exclusion, there were still problems coordinating social and public transport policies and there was a lack of good practice in this field.

Ms. Dagnogo highlighted that the application of article 123 of the French Urban Renewal Act (2000), which indicates that public transport should be free for people who earn less than a certain amount was applied with some difficulties. She also drew attention to the fact that transport was barely mentioned in national reports and that transport and urban planning policies did not always work together.

Ms. Dagnogo then explained that it was necessary for public transport to adapt, although there were some institutional barriers that prevented public transport in local areas to be organised in a coherent way. She argued that above all it was necessary to restructure the way transport is organised: local authorities should have all the necessary skills and responsibility to organise transport in the local area. This point of view is supported by GART members.

Ms. Dagnogo finished by saying that although a high quality public transport system was essential to a good quality of life, a recent survey carried out by ‘INSEE Premiere’ on people in the suburbs revealed that transport featured low on peoples’ list of concerns. It was also surprising because, compared to the national average, fewer people living in council houses would like to see improvements to public transport.

- **Introduction to ECLIPSE, Arnaud Lagrange, Transport & Travel Research Ltd – (ECLIPSE Coordinator)**

Mr. Lagrange presented background information and an overview of the ECLIPSE project. He explained that a previous project financed by the European Commission - MATISSE had identified that there was a link between transport and social inclusion but, there was also a lack of dialogue between actors and policy makers in both fields.

Mr. Lagrange then explained that ECLIPSE aimed to build on the MATISSE findings and actively engage transport professionals and other actors in creating strategic working partnerships for increasing the awareness of the effect of transport on social inclusion at the local, regional and European level. Mr. Lagrange gave an overview of the themes covered at previous ECLIPSE workshops and the ECLIPSE Conference in June 2006.

In addition to this, Mr. Lagrange briefly presented the UK National Action Plan (NAP), which is an example of a National Action Plan (NAP) which addresses the link between transport and social inclusion policies.



- **Transport and social inclusion: European initiatives, Ivo Cré, POLIS**

Mr Cré began by presenting POLIS, which is a network of cities and regions working towards innovative transport solutions. He went on to highlight the importance of defining and expanding the link between transport and social exclusion. Traditionally people connected transport and social exclusion to wheelchair users and the limited public transport available in rural areas, but, Mr. Cré stressed that the scope was much wider: for example, in the United Kingdom 2 out of 5 unemployed people think that the lack of transport acts as a barrier to finding a job and 50% of students aged between 16 and 18 years think that transport costs are too high. Other social effects should also be taken into account: every year 1.4 million people do not access medical facilities because they have no way of travelling there. He added that the links between transport and social exclusion are very complex - when certain factors are combined, the risk of being socially excluded increases. Mr Cré underlined the fact that accessibility should be integrated into policy making and planning.

Mr. Cré then went on to examine some of the solutions put in place by local authorities and transport operators and also highlighted the role of the European Union. He indicated that over a number of years EU policies aimed to reduce the distance between cities and thereby bring countries closer. At the same time, the EU wanted to avoid the negative effects of market deregulation, via the General Interest Services, with the idea that "it is better to

implement than legislate.” He explained that in this way, the National Action Plans had an important part to play in using transport as a tool to assist with social inclusion.

- **Transport, social and professional inclusion, Catherine Lesterpt, Direction Generale pour l’Action Sociale – DGAS (*Directorate-General for Social Affairs*)**

Ms. Lesterpt began by explaining the role of DGAS (Directorate General for Social Affairs), which is responsible for putting in place social policies for people at risk or suffering from social breakdown (children, disabled and older people, families, teenagers etc).

Ms. Lesterpt mentioned the 1998 law against exclusion and presented the situation in France: in 2004, 11.7% of the population (7 million people) lived below the poverty line (income of €7880 per person per annum).

Ms. Lesterpt talked about one study carried out by the French Social Ministry in 2003 that found that the lack of transport posed a problem for about 45% of people who received benefits from the government. The study also revealed that the cost of transport was a limiting factor when searching for a job. Ms. Lesterpt pointed out that in many cases, a car was essential to access a job and this was especially the case for people living or working in rural areas.

Ms. Lesterpt explained that young people, nuclear families, immigrants and unskilled workers were most likely to experience mobility problems, often due to the fact that transport services were not adapted to their needs. Ms. Lesterpt highlighted two significant factors that must be taken into account: the lack of transport on offer and the cost of transport.

Ms. Lesterpt then went on to consider some possible solutions: public transport should be adapted to peoples’ needs; this was one of the responsibilities of the public transport authorities (law voted on in 1982 on public transport). Ms. Lesterpt underlined the importance of evaluating peoples’ transport needs by working more closely with social services departments, employment agencies etc.

Ms. Lesterpt highlighted the work carried out by some local authorities who were improving public transport in rural areas by developing transport on demand and mobility centres offering advice on different modes of transport.

Ms. Lesterpt also talked about an article from the Urban Renewal Law (voted in 2000) requesting public transport authorities to offer “social fares”, with at least 50% off for people who earn less than €7,178 per year (art.123). However, Ms. Lesterpt explained that this article had not always been respected by local authorities, partially due to technical and administrative difficulties.

Ms. Lesterpt explained that nowadays councils in “Départements” were in charge of inter-urban transport in their area as well as being responsible for social policies with a role as coordinator between the different stakeholders. She explained that towns also had specific social services (Centre Communal d’action sociale - CCAS) with databases that could be used to analyse the transport needs of the population. She explained that there were also private actions implemented to help those who were socially excluded.



Ms. Lesterpt also indicated that a study into social exclusion and transport would be published shortly by the “Entreprise, Territoire et Développement” (ETD).

Morning Session - Part 2

Mary Crass (OECD) chaired the second part of the workshop.

- **Catherine Chartrain, Conseil National des Transports (*National Council of Transport*)**

Ms. Chartrain highlighted that there were various links between the use of public space and social exclusion. French town policy requested that local authorities “mix up” and integrate the population, but this was not that easy because many barriers needed to be broken down.

Ms. Chartrain also mentioned the role of fares in making transport more accessible to socially excluded people; indeed a lot of “social fares” had been introduced and other people (blind and disabled people) could now access the public transport system. She underlined the role of the state in promoting social equity but pointed out that this could take some time.

Ms. Chartrain explained that some improvements had taken place, for example the Roissy Charles-de-Gaulle airport: During the 1980s people who did not have access to a car could not go to Roissy Charles-de-Gaulle airport but there were plenty of job opportunities available at the airport. Ms. Chartrain explained that nowadays, it was possible to travel to the airport by public transport.

Ms. Chartrain also highlighted the high cost of obtaining a driving licence. For people living in the suburbs a driving licence could be essential to access a job and she suggested that this could be made free for some people.

Ms. Chartrain made a further point about urban policy - she believed that transport and quality of public space were closely linked. She also believed it was necessary to stop distinguishing between the city centre and the suburbs and reported that in some cases, city planners had largely ignored the suburbs. She pointed out that in some areas, the frequency of public transport from the city centre to the suburbs had decreased, whilst the population had not decreased and that there was a real need for transport in the suburbs.

Ms. Chartrain also highlighted the role of the tram as a tool for urban regeneration, citing the example of the tramway implemented in the Paris suburbs in the 1990s which improved transport capacity, quality of life and revived the area.

- **Patrick Ferri and Régis Savarit Syndicat Mixte de Transport de Clermont-Ferrand (*Clermont-Ferrand Public Transport Authority*)**

Clermont-Ferrand is the capital of the Auvergne region, with a population of approximately 140,000 and 300,000 if the metropolitan area is taken into account. The Syndicat Mixte de Transport (SMTC) is in charge of the transport issues for this metropolitan area.

In 2006, Clermont Ferrand introduced its first tramway line which is completely accessible. Previously the Clermont-Ferrand public transport network was not very accessible but SMTC wanted to improve this. SMTC therefore worked closely with the Council of the “Département” and followed the accessibility guidance published by CERTU. As a result of this cooperation, they have managed to implement specific systems for blind people in each tram and at each tram stop.

Mr. Ferri explained that in the Clermont-Ferrand metropolitan area, there were 800 public transport stops and including interurban transport, 1000 stops covering the area. He reported that €3 million had been invested to make the stops accessible and €220,000 to equip buses with ramps. He explained that there was a quality control service and signage as communication was considered to be very important. Monitoring is carried out every six months.



Mr. Savarit pointed out that public transport could not solve all social problems. He explained that some years ago, the way in which the network was organised and frequency of services meant that the services could not be used by the poorest people. However, improvements have now been made and the network has become more accessible to disabled people and unskilled workers etc. Mr. Savarit indicated that the new tram line served 80% of council houses.

- **Catherine Bachelier, Deleque Interministeriel à l'Accessibilité (*Ministerial Delegate responsible for Accessibility*)**



Ms. Bachelier highlighted the importance of how a person behaves in their urban space, whether it be the city or the suburbs. She asked; how can someone travel about in the city? How can we combat social exclusion? Ms. Bachelier said she believed that transport could play an important role in decreasing social exclusion.

Ms. Bachelier stressed the importance of adopting a holistic view of transport to avoid marginalising certain groups. Vulnerable people needed to be taken into account and should share in the transport system and space.

The second factor highlighted by Ms. Bachelier involved knowing how transport could be used to link people and the environment.

She also highlighted that social fares and the State could play an important role but that two aspects need to be respected: economic efficiency and social efficiency.

Ms. Bachelier talked about the law voted in February 2005 on Accessibility. The law stipulates that the transport system should be made accessible in the next ten years and covers a variety of disabilities, including wheelchair users and blind and elderly people etc. Public transport authorities have 3 years to write a Public Transport Accessibility Plan.

Ms. Bachelier highlighted that there was no point having accessible vehicles without accessible interchanges. In this respect, article 45 of the law stresses the importance of the accessibility chain. Indeed since more than 50% of the population encounters problems using public transport a comprehensive approach needs to be taken.

- **Discussion**

Ms. Dubois from Clichy-Montfermeil metropolitan area mentioned that it was very difficult for local authorities' officers to work with transport and social affairs. She stressed the importance of training civil servants in how to manage projects and that management needed to create links between private and public institutions. She added that she was able to link people who did not usually work together but that it was hard.

Ms. Chartrain stated that the question of car ownership was rarely taken into account and argued that the use of the car should be more regulated. She also mentioned that the Urban Travel Plan (*Plan de déplacements urbains*) was a good tool to link social and transport policy.



- **Site visit - organised by Francois Chovet from Ville de Sarcelles**

Delegates went on a site visit to Sarcelles (Ile-de-France region), a suburb in the outskirts of northern Paris. Sarcelles is located halfway between Paris and Roissy-Charles de Gaulle airport, which employs a large number of people. In the southern part of the town of Sarcelles, council flats (four-storey buildings) were built in the 1950s and 1960s to accommodate immigrants and people on low incomes: as a result, this area has become a social ghetto, where 30% of residents are unemployed. Sarcelles Council is looking at some transport solutions to their problems as detailed below.

The visit started at the two-level railway station where delegates observed that there were no connecting roads between Sarcelles and the neighbouring town of Garges, which has created a lack of social links between the two towns.

Many people working in Sarcelles work in Roissy-Charles de Gaulle airport but there is no direct connection between the airport and Sarcelles. At present, people have to travel to the airport via central Paris, which makes the journey long. One solution could be to provide direct trains between Charles de Gaulle airport and Sarcelles. There is also an on-demand bus service called "Allobus" for inhabitants of Sarcelles to travel to the airport. The service is financed by the Departmental Council, the regional public transport authority and the town of Tremblay-en-France. However, the future of this service is uncertain.

There is also a policy by the local government to encourage businesses to come to the centre of Sarcelles, close to council housing, in order to improve the local quality of life.

The tramway project started 10 years ago, after long negotiations. The tramway work will start in 2007/2008 and will serve 15 stations on a 6.6 kilometre stretch between Saint-Denis and Garges RER station, via Pierrefitte-sur-Seine and Sarcelles. It is hoped that the tramway will provide a good opportunity to improve the area and the attractiveness of the railway stations in the towns. This project is financed partially by the metropolitan area, the Etablissement Public d'Aménagement (EPA), the Ile-de-France Region and the Government.



Francois Pupponi, Mayor of Sarcelles

Mr. Pupponi, the Mayor of Sarcelles spoke about some of the challenges facing Sarcelles: for example; 60% of inhabitants do not pay income tax and as Sarcelles was built in the 1960s (primarily as a solution to the housing crisis) there are not many businesses and as a result the town does not receive any business tax (in France, companies located in towns have to pay income tax locally). In this way, Sarcelles loses out on this money and in comparison with other towns of a similar size, Sarcelles receives 30% less revenue but needs double the amount of money. For example, Levallois-Perret (one of the richest cities in Western Paris) receives €410 million per annum from companies and Sarcelles receives only €44 million. In addition, he highlighted the big difference in the amount of funding allocated to the city centres and the amount allocated to the suburbs. Consequently, it has been difficult to find the funds to finance a project such as the tramway. The budget for the tramway comes partially from Val-de-France and the EPA within the framework of the State/Region Contract Plan (€300,000 from Val-de-France) and with additional funding from GPV (Main Urban Planning project for cities) and from FEDER.

In the Ile-de-France Region, Mr. Pupponi stated that local travel plans are being written; those plans that concern Sarcelles focus on the links with Roissy-Charles de Gaulle airport.

He reported that there were now plans to develop housing in the suburbs, thanks to ANRU (National Agency for Urban Renovation). They plan to knock down old, high-density council houses and replace them with newer, less dense housing. This can be seen as a positive action to improve the quality of life, but it also creates other problems, such as displacing the population in areas, due to the increase in rent.

According to the Mayor, the suburbs are not often taken into account by the Minister, due to the lack of representatives from the suburbs at the Senate and National Assembly.

Marie-Michelle Pisani, "Mission Locale"

Ms. Pisani presented the organisation that she works for, "Mission Locale". Mission Locale was set up in 1992 and its main role is to help young people, essentially by assisting them with finding jobs. In Sarcelles, Mission Locale has helped 41,000 people aged between 16 and 25 years old. They assist 6,000 young people, of which 4,000 are in Val-de-France. Ms. Pisani explained that young people have mobility problems: in France each pupil has to go to the closest school to where they live ("carte scolaire") but the question of transport is not included in the "carte scolaire". For example, it is difficult to travel 6 km from Sarcelles to Enghein-les-Bains because there is no convenient transport.

She added that young people need to be mobile, but have limited funds. Mission Locale has worked with organisations such as RATP to tackle this issue. Another example is the cooperation with "Association Papa Charlie" which offers people with limited funds access to a car sharing scheme. Instead of paying for the car, the users have to maintain the car. Mission Locale encourages young people to use the service. However, such an initiative is costly and the long term funding is uncertain.

Discussion:

A representative from La Ciotat (South of France) asked about transport on demand for socially excluded people. In La Ciotat, funds have been allocated to allow people who do not have much money to use a motorbike. However, he highlighted the problems of funding such a project and indicated that private/public partnerships are hard to implement and sometimes it has meant entering into competition with public transport.

Mr. Panchout, from the Institut d'Etudes Politiques of Paris asked how Sarcelles, the metropolitan area and the Mission Locale worked with RATP.

Ms. Pisani replied that there was work carried out with recruitment and organising the Mobility Clun with Val-de-France. She said that links with the SNCF (French national rail transport) were not very fruitful.

Mr. Lagrange asked how the local authorities worked with Reseau Ferre de France for the attribution of the slots for trains between Paris and Sarcelles.

The Mayor replied that it was very difficult to work with them and that the same problem remained: they did not have real responsibility and knowledge in the transport field.



5. Conclusions

Coordination between national and local policies

Different speakers were in agreement on the lack of cooperation and discussion between different ministries and local authorities. Local authorities often have financial pressures when trying to deliver national government policies. Often, local authorities do not see how social inclusion (often dealt with in other documents) and transport policies can be applied in the local area when this issue is not clear at the national level. It is therefore essential to develop better coordination between transport and social affairs. Some urban travel plans have started to recognise transport and its social impacts but there are few good practice examples in France.

Widen the concept of “disability”

The Accessibility law voted in 2005, highlights the importance of widening the concept of “disability” to include blind people, people with impairments, wheelchair users etc. For a long time, the concept of disability only related to wheelchair users. It is important to identify the needs of different groups and possible solutions.

The use of public space

Public space is used by a range of different kinds of users who have different needs from their environment. It should be recognised that the limitations of certain environments (or ‘disability’) are not always obvious. Therefore, in order to make these public spaces more accessible to all, all users of the space (walkers, cars, loading and unloading operations etc) need to be taken into account when making improvements to the quality of information available and the terrain etc. Solutions can be technical (as presented by Clermont-Ferrand at the workshop), but solutions can also be organisational so that everybody knows that the public space is a shared space. A sociological approach is also essential to understand the impacts of a new system on people.

The change in concepts and approaches to urban planning and transport policies

Until the beginning of the 1990s, mobility was not taken into account in town planning policies. As a result it is important to take into account mobility needs for travel between central areas and suburbs, but also for inter-suburban movements. Fare policy is an important tool in this respect which has to be adapted to the local situation.

In addition, some suburban areas (like Sarcelles) are isolated due to the pattern of urban development and major infrastructure. Here again, solutions are generally technical to enable better use of the infrastructure, better security and increased frequency of public transport services in the suburbs. In socially excluded suburbs like Sarcelles, it is important to encourage mixed use development of residential areas, businesses and pleasant public spaces.

Financial issues

A new approach to the organisation of transport is essential and it is important to cooperate with different stakeholders. The costs of introducing new technologies for new services are high. In this respect, local authorities should receive funds for investment in transport but also for social affairs. More investment is essential to improve the quality of public transport.

Annex A

List of participants

Name	Organisation
Karim Ait-Youcef	Association Voiture & co
Catherine Bachelier	Ministère des transports et l'accessibilité
Helene Bodhuin	Conseil General du Bas-Rhin
Gabrielle Bussac-Médale	Institut pour la Ville en Mouvement
Charlotte Charbonniaud	Entreprises Territoires & Développement (ETD)
Catherine Chartrain	Conseil National des Transports (CNT)
Morgane Chusseau	Fédération Nationale des Transports de Voyageurs (FNTV)
Francois Chovet	Ville de Sarcelles
Sarah Clifford	Transport & Travel Research Ltd (TTR)('ECLIPSE' Consortium)
Jean-Frederic Collet	Régie Autonome des Transports Parisiens (RATP)
Mary Crass	Organisation de coopération et de développement économiques (OCDE)
Ivo Cré	POLIS ('ECLIPSE' Consortium)
Olivier Crepin	Groupement des Autorités Responsables de Transport
Claire Dagnogo	Groupement des Autorités Responsables de Transport
Anne Delhomme	Association Voiture & co
Djibril Dembele-Cabot	La Communauté d'Agglomération de Clichy-sous-Bois / Montfermeil
Ester Dubois	La Communauté d'Agglomération de Clichy-sous-Bois / Montfermeil
Christiane El Hayek	Conseil national des politiques de lutte contre la pauvreté et l'exclusion
Renée Feltin	Ville et banlieue
Patrick Ferri	Syndicat mixte des transports en commun de l'agglomération
Laurent Fouillé	Rennes Métropole
Sylvain Haon	POLIS
Gérard Hillaire	Ministère des Transports
Leire Iriarte	POLIS ('ECLIPSE' Consortium)
Arnaud Lagrange	Transport & Travel Research Ltd (TTR) ('ECLIPSE' Consortium)
Catherine Lesterpt	Direction Générale de l'Action Sociale
Audrey Liny	Groupement des Autorités Responsables de Transport
Lydia Mammari	AGIR
Robert Napoly	CACEN/CFTU
Benjamin Panchout	Institut d'études politiques de Paris
Nicolas Pavil	Agglomération Val-de-France
Annie Peronnet	Ville de Sarcelles
Claude Peyclet	Ministère des Petites Moyennes Entreprises du Commerce, de l'Artisanat et des Professions Libérales
Marie-Michelle Pisani	Mission Locale
Francois Pupponi	Ville de Sarcelles
Alina Purice	Regia Autonomă de Transport București ('ECLIPSE' Consortium)
Philippe Robino	Conseil Général du Loiret
Régis Savarit	Syndicat mixte des transports en commun de l'agglomération
Andre Sobreira	La Communauté d'Agglomération de Clichy-sous-Bois / Montfermeil
Gérard Uzan	Université Paris 8

Annex B

Presentations

Not attached